



## INDIA–PAKISTAN RELATIONS: A HISTORICAL ANALYSIS

**Bhisma Narayan Sabar**

*Ph. D. Research Scholar, Department of Political Science, Ravenshaw University, Cuttack.*

### Abstract

*Relations between India and Pakistan have been complex and largely hostile due to a number of historical and political events. Relations between the two states have been defined by the violent partition of British India in 1947 which started the Kashmir conflict, and the numerous military conflicts fought between the two nations. Consequently, their relationship has been plagued by hostility and suspicion. Both India and Pakistan hold different views regarding their conflict; to Pakistan it is Kashmir, where as for India it is Cross-border terrorism across the Line of Control (LOC), supported by Pakistan. The indo-Pakistan conflict has also hampered the development of economic and trade cooperation between them. Time is ripe when both the countries should try to resolve their differences and move towards peace and cooperation. The central objective of this paper is to discuss about the relations between India and Pakistan since the formation of both countries. And also discuss certain agreement/summit between two nations for normalising the situation. Finally the paper concludes with some suggestions for improving cordial relationship between India and Pakistan.*

**Key words:** cooperation, conflicts, relationship, summit,



*Scholarly Research Journal's* is licensed Based on a work at [www.srjis.com](http://www.srjis.com)

### Introduction:

After the dissolution of the British Raj in 1947, two new sovereign nations were formed—the Dominion of India and the Dominion of Pakistan. The subsequent partition of the former British India displaced up to 12.5 million people, with estimates of loss of life varying from several hundred thousand to 1 million<sup>1</sup>. India emerged as a secular nation with a Hindu majority population and a large Muslim minority, while Pakistan, with a Muslim majority population and a large Hindu minority, later became an Islamic Republic, although its constitution guaranteed freedom of religion to people of all faiths<sup>2</sup>. It later lost most of its Hindu minority due to migration and the separation of East Pakistan in the Bangladesh Liberation War.

Soon after gaining their independence, India and Pakistan established diplomatic relations, but the violent partition and reciprocal territorial claims quickly overshadowed their relationship. Since their independence, the two countries have fought three major wars, as well as one undeclared war, and have been involved in numerous armed skirmishes and military standoffs. The Kashmir conflict is the main centre-point of all of these conflicts with

the exception of the Indo-Pakistan War of 1971 and the Bangladesh Liberation War, which resulted in the secession of East Pakistan (now Bangladesh).

There have been numerous attempts to improve the relationship, particularly (1) the Shimla summit, (2) the Agra summit, and (3) the Lahore summit. Which are discussing below:

### **1. Shimla Summit:**

The Simla Agreement, or Shimla Agreement, was signed between India and Pakistan on 3 July 1972 in Shimla, the capital city of the Indian state of Himachal Pradesh<sup>3</sup>. It followed from the Bangladesh Liberation war in 1971 that led to the independence of Bangladesh, which was earlier known as East Pakistan and was part of the territory of Pakistan. India entered the war as an ally of Bangladesh which transformed the war into an Indo-Pakistani War of 1971.

The agreement was the result of resolve of both the countries to "put an end to the conflict and confrontation that have hitherto marred their relations". It conceived the steps to be taken for further normalisation of mutual relations and it also laid down the principles that should govern their future relations.

#### **Details of the Simla agreement:**

The treaty was signed in Simla (also spelt "Shimla") in India by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, the President of Pakistan, and Indira Gandhi, the Prime Minister of India<sup>4</sup>. The agreement also paved the way for diplomatic recognition of Bangladesh by Pakistan. Technically the document was signed at 0040 hours in the night of 3 July; despite this official documents are dated 2 July 1972<sup>5</sup>. Some of the major outcomes of the Simla Agreement are:

Both countries will "settle their differences by peaceful means through bilateral negotiations". India has, many a times, maintained that Kashmir dispute is a bilateral issue and must be settled through bilateral negotiations as per Simla Agreement, 1972 and thus, had denied any third party intervention even that of United Nations.

The agreement converted the cease-fire line of 17 December 1971 into the Line of Control (LOC) between India and Pakistan and it was agreed that "neither side shall seek to alter it unilaterally, irrespective of mutual differences and legal interpretations". Many Indian bureaucrats have later argued that a tacit agreement, to convert this LOC into international border, was reached during a one-on-one meeting between the two heads of government. However, Pakistani bureaucrats have denied any such thing. This identification of a new "cease-fire line" by both the states has been argued by India as making United Nations

Military Observer Group in India and Pakistan insignificant. As according to India, the purpose of UNMOGIP was to monitor the cease-fire line as identified in Karachi agreement of 1949 which no longer exists. However, Pakistan have a different take on this issue and both countries still host the UN mission<sup>6</sup>.

The agreement has not prevented the relationship between the two countries from deteriorating to the point of armed conflict, most recently in the Kargil War of 1999. In Operation Meghdoot of 1984 India seized all of the inhospitable Siachen Glacier region where the frontier had been clearly not defined in the agreement (possibly as the area was thought too barren to be controversial); this was considered as a violation of the Simla Agreement by Pakistan. Most of the subsequent deaths in the Siachen Conflict have been from natural disasters, e.g. avalanches in 2010, 2012, and 2016.

## **2. Lahore Summit:**

The Lahore Declaration was a bilateral agreement and governance treaty between India and Pakistan. The treaty was signed on 21 February 1999, at the conclusion of a historic summit in Lahore, and ratified by the parliaments of both countries the same year.

Under the terms of the treaty, a mutual understanding was reached towards the development of atomic arsenals and to avoid accidental and unauthorised operational use of nuclear weapons. The Lahore Declaration brought added responsibility to both nations' leadership towards avoiding nuclear race, as well as both non-conventional and conventional conflicts. This event was significant in the history of Pakistan and it provided both countries an environment of mutual confidence. In a much-covered televised press conference in both countries, Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif and Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee signed the treaty. It was the second nuclear control treaty signed by both countries and pledged to continue the use of the first treaty, Non-Nuclear Aggression Agreement (NNAA), was signed in 1988. The Lahore treaty was quickly ratified by the parliaments of India and Pakistan and came into force the same year<sup>7</sup>.

The Lahore Declaration signalled a major breakthrough in overcoming the historically strained bilateral relations between the two nations in the aftermath of the publicly performed atomic tests carried out by both nations in May 1998. Widely popular in the public circles in Pakistan and hailed by the international community, the relations would soon lose impetus with the outbreak of the controversial Kargil debacle in May 1999.

### **3. Agra Summit:**

Earlier in 1999, during Indian Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee's visit to Pakistan, both countries had acceded and successfully ratified the Lahore Declaration and pledged to make joint efforts for peace and stability in South Asia. The Kargil war was a major blow to the Lahore treaty and it stalled the treaty as the relations between two countries suffered a serious setback. General Musharraf is widely believed to be a strategic mastermind and brain behind the Kargil war.

On 11 March 2001, the UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan called upon both India and Pakistan to retain the spirit of the Lahore Declaration, saying that it would require restraint, wisdom, and constructive steps from both sides. Finally, the framework for negotiations of the Agra treaty began with talks in New Delhi between President Pervez Musharraf and Prime Minister Atal Bihari Vajpayee in July 2001.

After much diplomatic efforts, the Agra summit started amid high hopes of resolving various disputes between the two countries including the five decades old Kashmir issue. Both sides started the summit with hopefulness and in a spirit of good will; especially President Musharraf who used the phrases "cautious optimism", "flexibility" and "open mind" to describe his views for the summit. The Indian President, K. R. Narayanan, also promised to take "bold and innovative" measures and to discuss the "core issue" between the two countries.

Various rounds of one-to-one talks were held between President Musharraf and Prime Minister Vajpayee. On the first day, a 90-minute one-on-one session was held and the two leaders discussed the Kashmir issue, cross-border terrorism, nuclear risk reduction, release of prisoners of war, and commercial ties. There were high hopes in Pakistan that both the leaders would arrive at an agreement and a joint statement or declaration would be made at the end of the summit as the two leaders plunged into serious talks. Despite reservations from the Indian Government, President Musharraf also held face-to-face meetings with the top Kashmiri leadership represented by the All Parties Hurriyat Conference<sup>8</sup>.

The most important agenda of Prime Minister, Atal Bihari Vajpayee, in the Indo-Pak summit was to stress upon the economic betterment of the people of Kashmir, for which he invited a dialogue with the All Parties Hurriyat Conference.

Since the early 1980s, relations between the two nations have grown increasingly sour, particularly after the Siachen conflict, intensification of the Kashmir insurgency in

1989, Indian and Pakistani nuclear tests in 1998, and the 1999 Kargil War. Which are discusses below in detail manner:

### **1. Siachen Conflict:**

The Siachen conflict, sometimes referred to as the Siachen War, was a military conflict between India and Pakistan over the disputed Siachen Glacier region in Kashmir. A cease-fire went into effect in 2003<sup>9</sup>. The contended area is nearly 1,000 square miles (2,600 km<sup>2</sup>) of territory. The conflict was started in 1984 by India's successful capture of the Siachen Glacier as part of Operation Meghdoot, and subsequently continued with Operation Rajiv. India took control of the 70-kilometre-long (43 mi) Siachen Glacier and its tributary glaciers, as well as all the main passes and heights of the Saltoro Ridge immediately west of the glacier, including Sia La, Bilafond La, and Gyong La. Pakistan controls the glacial valleys immediately west of the Saltoro Ridge<sup>10</sup>. According to TIME magazine, India gained control of more than 2500 km<sup>2</sup> of territory because of its military operations in Siachen.

### **2. Insurgency in Jammu and Kashmir**

The insurgency in Jammu and Kashmir (also Kashmiri Insurgency, or Kashmir Intifada is an uprising or revolt against the Indian administration of Jammu and Kashmir, a region constituting the southern portion of the larger Kashmir region, which has been the subject of a dispute between India and Pakistan since 1947<sup>11</sup>.

Jammu and Kashmir, long a breeding ground of separatist ambitions, has been wracked by the insurgency since 1989. Although the failure of Indian governance and democracy lay at the root of the initial disaffection, Pakistan played an important role in converting the latter into a fully developed insurgency. Some insurgent groups in Kashmir support the complete independence, whereas others seek accession to Pakistan.

More explicitly, the roots of the insurgency are tied to a dispute over local autonomy. Democratic development was limited in Kashmir until the late 1970s and by 1988 many of the democratic reforms provided by the Indian government had been reversed and non-violent channels for expressing discontent were limited and caused a dramatic increase in support for insurgents advocating violent secession from India<sup>12</sup>. In 1987, a disputed State election created a catalyst for the insurgency when it resulted in some of the state's legislative assembly members forming armed insurgent groups. In July 1988, a series of demonstrations, strikes and attacks on the Indian government began the Kashmir insurgency, which during the 1990s escalated into the most important internal security issue in India.

Pakistan claims to be giving its "moral and diplomatic" support to the separatist movement. The Inter-Services Intelligence of Pakistan has been accused by India and the international community of supporting, supplying arms and training mujahideen, to fight in Jammu and Kashmir. In 2015, former President of Pakistan Pervez Musharraf admitted that Pakistan had supported and trained insurgent groups in the 1990s.[41] India has repeatedly called Pakistan to end its "cross-border terrorism" in Kashmir.[37] Several new militant groups with radical Islamic views emerged and changed the ideological emphasis of the movement to Islamic. This had happened partly due to a large number of Islamic "Jihadi" fighters (mujahadeen) who had entered the Kashmir valley following the end of the Soviet–Afghan War in the 1980s<sup>13</sup>.

The conflicts between the militants and the Indian forces have led to large number of casualties. Many civilians have also died as a result of being targeted by the various armed groups. According to official figures released in Jammu and Kashmir assembly, there were 3,400 disappearance cases and the conflict has left more than 47,000 people dead which also include 7,000 police personnel as of July 2009. Some rights groups claim a higher figure of 100,000 deaths since 1989. Since the revocation of the special status of Jammu and Kashmir in August 2019, the Indian military has intensified its counter-insurgency operations. Clashes in the first half of 2020 left 229 dead, including 32 civilians. The 283 people killed in all of 2019 were the highest toll for a decade<sup>14</sup>.

### **3. Kargil War**

The Kargil War, also known as the Kargil conflict, was an armed conflict between India and Pakistan that took place between May and July 1999 in the Kargil district of Kashmir and elsewhere along the Line of Control (LOC). In India, the conflict is also referred to as Operation Vijay (literally "Victory"), which was the name of the Indian operation to clear the Kargil sector. The Indian Air Force's role in acting jointly with Indian Army ground troops during the war was aimed at flushing out regular and irregular troops of the Pakistani Army from vacated Indian Positions in the Kargil sector along the Line of Control. This particular operation was given the code name Operation Safed Sagar ("Operation White Sea").

The cause of the war was the infiltration of Pakistani soldiers disguised as Kashmiri militants into positions on the Indian side of the LOC, which serves as the de facto border between the two states. During the initial stages of the war, Pakistan blamed the fighting

entirely on independent Kashmiri insurgents, but documents left behind by casualties and later statements by Pakistan's Prime Minister and Chief of Army Staff showed involvement of Pakistani paramilitary forces, led by General Ashraf Rashid.[28] The Indian Army, later supported by the Indian Air Force, recaptured a majority of the positions on the Indian side of the LOC infiltrated by the Pakistani troops and militants. Facing international diplomatic opposition, the Pakistani forces withdrew from the remaining Indian positions along the LOC<sup>15</sup>.

The war is the most recent example of high-altitude warfare in mountainous terrain, and as such posed significant logistical problems for the combating sides. It is also the sole instance of direct, conventional warfare between nuclear states (i.e., those possessing nuclear weapons). India had conducted its first successful test in 1974; Pakistan, which had been developing its nuclear capability in secret since around the same time, conducted its first known tests in 1998, just two weeks after a second series of tests by India.

Certain confidence-building measures, such as the 2003 ceasefire agreement and the Delhi–Lahore Bus service, have been successful in de-escalating tensions. However, these efforts have been impeded by periodic terrorist attacks. The 2001 Indian Parliament attack brought the two nations to the brink of a nuclear war. The 2007 Samjhauta Express bombings, which killed 68 civilians (most of whom were Pakistani), was also a crucial turning point in relations. Additionally, the 2008 Mumbai attacks carried out by Pakistani militants resulted in a severe blow to the ongoing India–Pakistan peace talks.

After a brief thaw following the election of new governments in both nations, bilateral discussions again stalled after the 2016 Pathankot attack<sup>16</sup>. In September 2016, a terrorist attack on an Indian military base in Indian-administered Kashmir killed 19 Indian Army soldiers, the deadliest such attack in years. India's claim that the attack had been orchestrated by a Pakistan-supported jihadist group was denied by Pakistan, which claimed the attack had been a local reaction to unrest in the region due to excessive force by Indian security personnel. The attack sparked a military confrontation across the Line of Control, with an escalation in ceasefire violations and further militant attacks on Indian security forces. Since 2016, the ongoing confrontation, continued terrorist attacks, and an increase in nationalist rhetoric on both sides has resulted in the collapse of bilateral relations, with little expectation that they will recover. Notably, following the 2019 Pulwama attack, the Indian government revoked Pakistan's most favoured nation trade status, which it had granted to

Pakistan in 1996<sup>17</sup>. India also increased the custom duty to 200% which affected the trade of Pakistani apparel and cement.

Since the election of new governments in both India and Pakistan in the early 2010s, some attempts have been made to improve relations, in particular the development of a consensus on the agreement of Non-Discriminatory Market Access on Reciprocal Basis (NDMARB) status for each other, which will liberalize trade. Both India and Pakistan are members of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation and its South Asian Free Trade Area. Pakistan used to host a pavilion at the annual India International Trade Fair which drew huge crowds. Deteriorating relations between the two nations resulted in a boycott of Pakistani traders at the trade fair<sup>18</sup>.

In November 2015, Indian Prime Minister Narendra Modi and Pakistani Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif agreed to the resumption of bilateral talks; the following month, Modi made a brief, unscheduled visit to Pakistan while en route to India, becoming the first Indian Prime Minister to visit Pakistan since 2004. Despite those efforts, relations between the countries have remained frigid, following repeated acts of cross-border terrorism. According to a 2017 BBC World Service poll, only 5% of Indians view Pakistan's influence positively, with 85% expressing a negative view, while 11% of Pakistanis view India's influence positively, with 62% expressing a negative view.

In August 2019, following the approval of the Jammu and Kashmir Reorganisation Bill in the Indian Parliament, which revoked the special status of Jammu and Kashmir, further tension was brought between the two countries, with Pakistan downgrading their diplomatic ties, closing its airspace, and suspending bilateral trade with India<sup>19</sup>.

### **Conclusion:**

The relations between India and Pakistan have been in a state of constant flux, ever since their independence. They have fought four wars. Military confrontation between them has been the reason for other developmental and economic issues being pushed in to the back ground. Needless to say South Asian countries constitute over 40% of the global poverty and need enormous resources and efforts to eliminate the scourge of poverty but unprecedented defense expenditure has prevented both India and Pakistan to do that. Security issues continued to remain the pivot around which countries of the region have shaped their national and regional policies



There is a huge potential for the expansion of bilateral trade between India and Pakistan. The Indo-Pak relationship has not reached a stage yet where the economic logic takes precedence over the political differences between the two countries. The existing barriers that restrict the movement of people, goods and investment within and across the region, need to be dismantled to unlock the development potential of South Asia. It should be possible for the two dominant South Asian countries to convert the entire Indo-Pak border into soft border. Both countries need to engage in continuous dialogue process so that gradual and steady progress could be made in resolving their contentious and intractable issues. There is no other alternative to continuous dialogue process. Political will and seriousness on both sides of the border is essential to usher in peace between the two countries.

The following measures are suggested which would help to improve cordial relations between the two countries:

- South Asia is home to one-fifth of humanity. Around 20% of world's population lives in this region with plenty of problems and issues like illiteracy, poverty, malnutrition, scarcity of water, unemployment and etc. India and Pakistan peace will help other regional states to overcome their common, specifically, non-traditional problems and issues.
- There is much pressure from the peoples from the India and Pakistan on the two respective governments. The masses on the two sides have changed their stereotyped mindsets after the commencement of the people to people contact. The revival of diplomatic contacts and reopening of their High Commissions have played a greater role in this regard. Exchange of scholars, artists, politicians, educationists and above all common people who are visiting their relatives across the borders helped the people to overcome threat perception at public level.
- Agro- Climatic conditions being same in both the countries, possibilities for agriculture co-operation should be explored and enhanced. It will help in attaining food self-sufficiency and earning revenue from the other countries.
- The media can bring the people close and create harmony between two nations. The media of both countries can play an effective role by objectively presenting the news and Pakistan and India should start educational ties and offer scholarships for the students of each country and should invite the scholars to come and visit each other and do researches on common interests.

- The literature and syllabus books should not contain hatred to each other and both governments should revise and rewrite the history without depicting hostility to each other.
- There should be cultural exchange programs between India and Pakistan. The artists programs and films and there should be know the Indian Cultural traditions and values.
- Pakistan should invite and take help from the film makers and singers of India to boost its film industry. There should be inter-cultural dialogue between the activists, students, writers, scholars, historians to promote peace and harmony between two nations.

### References:

- 
- Metcalf, Barbara D. and Metcalf, Thomas R. (2006), "A Concise History of India", (2nd ed.), Cambridge University Press, pp. 221-222.
- Marshall, Cavendish. (2006) "World and Its Peoples", Marshall Cavendish. p. 396.
- "Simla Agreement". [https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral\\_documents.htm?dtl/5541/Simla+Agreement](https://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral_documents.htm?dtl/5541/Simla+Agreement)
- <https://www.dawn.com/news/751253>
- <https://web.archive.org/web/20131002132702/http://ksgindia.com/study-material/editorial-series/3885-relevance-of-simla-agreement.html>
- <https://indianexpress.com/news/india-spikes-pak-call-for-third-party-mediation-says-simla-agreement-tops-all-agendas/1063018/0>
- [https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/file/resources/collections/peace\\_agreements/ip\\_lahore19990221.pdf](https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/file/resources/collections/peace_agreements/ip_lahore19990221.pdf)
- <http://storyofpakistan.com/agra-summit/>
- Watson, Paul (2003). "India and Pakistan Agree to Cease-Fire in Kashmir", *Los Angeles Times*, November 26.
- Child, Greg (1998). *Thin air: encounters in the Himalayas*. The Mountaineers Books, 1998.
- Margolis, Eric (2004) "War at the Top of the World: The Struggle for Afghanistan, Kashmir and Tibet", Routledge. p. 81
- [https://www.ucdp.uu.se/gpdata/gpcountry.php?id=74&regionSelect=6-Central\\_and\\_Southern\\_Asia&id=74&regionSelect=6-Central\\_and\\_Southern\\_Asia#](https://www.ucdp.uu.se/gpdata/gpcountry.php?id=74&regionSelect=6-Central_and_Southern_Asia&id=74&regionSelect=6-Central_and_Southern_Asia#)
- [http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/english/static/in\\_depth/south\\_asia/2002/india\\_pakistan/timeline/1989.stm](http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/english/static/in_depth/south_asia/2002/india_pakistan/timeline/1989.stm)
- <https://www.dw.com/en/kashmir-a-year-of-lockdown-and-lost-autonomy/a-54437369>
- <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/war/kargil-99.htm>
- <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-news-india/sushma-swaraj-pakistan-terrorism-john-kerry-india-visit-3004565/>
- Geeta Anand, and Hari Kumar (29 November 2016), "Militants Attack Indian Army Base in Nagrota, Inflaming Tensions With Pakistan", *The New York Times*.
- "Non-discriminatory market access: Pakistan, India all but sign trade normalisation deal". *The Express Tribune*. 15 March 2014.
- <https://www.timesnownews.com/international/article/pakistan-downscales-diplomatic-relationship-suspends-bilateral-trade-with-india/465213>